CAMPBELLTOWN CITY COUNCIL

Confidential Item

For Council meeting to be held on

Tuesday 3 December 2024 at 7.00 pm

Refer Item 11.9

Confidential Item

11.9 Tender Report – Concrete Works 2024

Contract and Fleet Coordinator, Andrew King's Report

Purpose of Report

To advise Council of the outcome of a Tender Evaluation for the Concrete Works for 2024.

Strategic Plan Link

Focus Area 3.1.2 Embrace proactive and innovative maintenance for all assets

Previous Council/Committee Resolution

Nil.

Background

Tenders were called for the provision of Concrete Works within Campbelltown City Council. Two rates were requested, namely the preparation and lay of concrete and lay only.

The contract term is for the three Financial Years, ending 30 June 2027 and subject to satisfactory performance and any other conditions which may prevail at the time. The Council may consider one optional right of renewal of two years to be exercised at Council's absolute discretion.

Tenders were downloaded on 8 October 2024 in the presence of Council's Contract and Fleet Coordinator, Administration Officer Finance and Records Officer.

Discussion

Seven organisations submitted a Tender for this project:

- Allied Kerbing & Concrete SA
- Kerb-Tec
- M&B Civil Engineering
- Nova Group Services
- Parisi Paving
- Remo Contractors
- Trueline Kerbing.

The tenders were assessed by a Tender Evaluation Panel with respect to their reliability, business capability, quality of service, environment management system, work health and safety, any previous works undertaken by the companies and the tendered rates. All tenders met the specifications that Council required through the tender document. Attached separately is the tender evaluation report for Members' information.

The assessment panel believe that the majority of the companies could deliver the project, however the successful companies were selected due to the following reasons:

- Proven experience on similar projects
- Past project capacity including their track record
- Understanding of the project
- Experienced Staff
- High regard to Work Health Safety
- Understanding of the project
- Project Management Skills
- Competitive rates
- Relevant experience.

As this tender will provide concrete work mainly for Council's Road Renewal Program, the anticipated total cost based on the 2024/2025 Road Renewal Program is in the order of $1.5 million for lay only work or up to $ 2.5 million should the contractor be undertaking the preparation work as well as concrete laying. However, as most of the preparation work will be undertaken by Staff the anticipated cost of this contract is more likely to be in the order of $1.5 million per annum.

It is important that Council finalises its works program and completes all Road Renewal works prior to May each year and therefore engaging two contractors on a panel contract is proposed as the most beneficial outcome for Council.

The two preferred tenderers have been undertaking these services for various metropolitan Councils over a number of years. They have proven to be very flexible in meeting the needs and the requirements of the organisations they have been working for.

One of the preferred contractors is one of Council's long-standing contractors undertaking similar work.

Social Implications

There are no social implications in relation to this report.

Environmental Implications

There are no environmental implications in relation to this report.

Asset Management Implications

Any assets installed or upgraded will be depreciated accordingly.

Governance / Risk Management

Management of tenders in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy is good governance and best practice to minimise reputational and legal risk.

Community Engagement

There are no Community engagement implications in relation to this report.

Regional Implications

There are no regional implications in relation to this report.

Economic Development Implications

The engagement of local contractors will help the South Australian economy.

Financial Implications

The costs to supply and deliver the services is by unit rate. Detailed cost estimation is attached for Members' information and currently there are adequate funds with the budget for 2024/2025.

Recommendation

Council authorise Staff to engage Nova Group Services and Allied Kerbing & Concrete SA on a Panel Contract to provide their services with respect to Concrete Works at their tendered unit rates until 30 June 2027.

CAMPBELLTOWN
CITY COUNCIL

Tender Evaluation Report

Concrete Works 2024

Cost centre Various

Date: 21/11/24

Prepared by: Andrew King

1. Background

The Campbelltown City Council invited tenders from companies for the provision of Concrete Works within the Campbelltown City Council.

2. Contract Term

The contract term is for the 24/25, 25/26, 26/27 Financial Years, ending 30/6/27.

Subject to satisfactory performance and any other conditions which may prevail at the time the Council may consider one (1) optional rights of renewal of two (2) years to be exercised at Council's absolute discretion).

3. Procurement Process

3.1. Open Tender Process

The Tender was released on the SA Tenders & Contract website. (www.tenders.sa.gov.au).

Tenders Opened: 17/9/24
Tenders Closed: 8/10/24 - 2:00pm

3.2. Document Issued

The document issued is the standard CCC RFT package, (ECM 6859350)

3.3. Tender Enquiries

One tender enquiry was received during the procurement process and this was replied to all parties that downloaded the documents from Tenders SA website.

3.4. Tender Briefing & Site Visit

No tender briefing or site visits were conducted.

4. Receipt of Tender & Evaluation

4.1. Receipt of Tenders

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

- Allied Kerbing and Concrete SA
- Kerb-Tec
- M&B Civil Engineering
- Nova Group Services
- Parisi Paving
- Remo Contractors
- Trueline Kerbing

No late tenders were received.

Tenders were opened shortly after the Closing Time by three Council staff that signed and documented the receipt of each tender. (ECM 6867698)

4.2. Evaluation Panel

The evaluation Panel consisted of:

- Mario Scalzi
- Luke Pirelli
- Nick De Palma
- Risk Management Coordinator (Natalie Barrington)- Management (WHS System & Insurances)
- Manager Finance (Evi Morrisson) - Management (Financial & Economic Stability only)

Each Member of the Evaluation Panel completed the Tender Declaration Form and declared "No Conflict of Interest" and agreed to keep confidential the contents of each tender. (ECM 6874797)

4.3. Evaluation Criteria

The evaluation criteria are as follow:

#	Assessment Criteria	Weighting
1	**Relevant Experience** (Previous work of this type etc.)	10.00%
2	**Track Record** (General reputation for work competence, capacity etc.)	10.00%
3	**Technical Skills** (People, systems, specific abilities etc.)	12.50%
4	**Methodology** (How the project is to be tackled, scope of work, value add, etc.)	12.50%
5	**Management** (Organisation, Environmental, Quality System)	5.00%
6	**Time Performance** (Meeting timeframes)	5.00%
7	**Management** (Insurances & WHS System)	7.50%
8	**Management** (Financial & Economic Stability)	7.50%
9	**Local** (Products, Goods/Works/Services & Contractors)	10.00%
10	**Price**	20.00%
	TOTAL	**100.00%**

4.4. Evaluation Selection

The evaluation was individually carried out by each evaluation panel member and then averaged out on (28/10/24) and the full evaluation matrix is in (ECM 6868101)

The summary of the evaluation is below:

Contractor	Price	Total Score	Rank
		100.0%	
Allied Kerbing and Concrete SA	$1,747,262	376.06	2
Kerb-Tec	$2,385,322	350.35	3
M&B Civil Engineering	$1,932,782	333.69	4
Nova Group Services	$1,540,264	408.55	1
Parisi Paving	$2,446,291	310.15	6
Remo Contractors	$2,357,507	320.74	5
Trueline Kerbing	$3,419,457	265.45	7

Note: Highest score is best - The summary of cost estimation is provided in the appendix.

4.5. Reference Checks

Staff checked the referees of **Allied Kerbing and Concrete SA** who provided positive feedback on their experience with the company.

No reference checks were undertaken for Nova Group Services as Council has used this supplier / contractor before and were satisfied with their performance.

5. Discussion

All of the 7 submissions for the Tender were detailed and it was a competitive process and, however the below **Nova Group Services** and **Allied Kerbing and Concrete SA** stood out from the rest on a number of fronts due to their:

- Understanding of the project
- Well experienced staff
- Quality systems in place
- Project Management Skills
- Competitive rates
- Relevant experience

It is important that Council finalises its works program and completes all Road Renewal works prior to May each year and engaging two contractors on a panel contract is proposed.

The two preferred tenderers have been undertaking these services for various metropolitan Councils and for a number of years on time and without any significant issues and have proven to be very flexible in meeting the needs and the requirements of the project.

6. Financial Implication

The costs to supply and deliver the services is by unit rate and currently there are adequate funds in the budget for 2024/25.

7. Terms of Payment

The contractor has requested payment of contract sum as highlighted below.

Option 3 (Schedule of Rates)

[X] Where the Contract is a Schedule of Rates the Contractor may at monthly intervals (or as otherwise specified in this agreement) submit a written claim for the works completed / service delivered.

8. Financial Sustainability

The Finance department tender evaluation is part for the final combined assessment.

Manager Finance to review the financial sustainability of all companies where the contract value is above $50,000 or where the contract value is below $50,000 and the contractor/tenderer requires an upfront payment.

It is noted the preferred contractors provided either insufficient financial statements or were deemed of "Poor Finance Stability", however due to the nature of the services provided (whereby services are

paid for once completed) the assessment panel believes the risk is low for Council if the company becomes insolvent, the service could be easily replaced.

9. Recommendation

That Nova Group Services and Allied Kerbing and Concrete SA be engaged on a Panel Contract to provide the services.

Although through a panel arrangement, each of the preferred contractors will have a combined value of less than $1m per year along with the term of the contract being three years (plus a two additional year extension at Council's discretion), it is recommended that Council endorse the engagement of the preferred contractors

10. Approval

Endorsed by:

Signed: [redacted] Date: 22/11/2024

General Manager Infrastructure, Planning & Sustainability Services

Endorsed by:

Signed: [redacted] Date: 25/11/2024

Chief Executive Officer

12

Appendix 1: Cost Comparison

Project - Pacific Ave

No	Type of work	Assumption	Allied Prep & Lay	Allied Lay only	Allied Cost (Lay only)	Allied Cost (Prep & Lay)	Kerb Tech Prep & Lay	Kerb Tech Lay only	Kerb Tech Cost (Lay only)	Kerb Tech Cost (Prep & Lay)	M&B Prep & Lay	M&B Lay only	M&B Cost (Lay only)	M&B Cost (Prep & Lay)
1	Machine laid kerb	5694	$ 170.00	$ 82.00	$ 466,908	$ 967,980	$ 205.00	$ 88.00	$ 501,072.00	$ 1,167,270.00	$ 211.00	$ 120.00	$ 683,280.00	$ 1,201,434.00
2	Hand Laid Kerb (approximately	295	$ 185.00	$ 88.00	$ 25,960	$ 54,575	$ 212.00	$ 90.00	$ 26,550.00	$ 62,540.00	$ 211.00	$ 120.00	$ 35,400.00	$ 62,245.00
3	Invert	2078	$ 185.00	$ 88.00	$ 182,864	$ 384,430	$ 220.00	$ 95.00	$ 197,410.00	$ 457,160.00	$ 220.00	$ 115.00	$ 238,970.00	$ 457,160.00
4	Concrete plinth	0	$ 190.00	$ 95.00	$ -	$ -	$ 190.00	$ 82.00	$ -	$ -	$ 165.00	$ 90.00	$ -	$ -
5	Spoon Drain - 600mm	0	$ 220.00	$ 105.00	$ -	$ -	$ 224.00	$ 95.00	$ -	$ -	$ 250.00	$ 130.00	$ -	$ -
6	Spoon Darin - 900mm	89	$ 280.00	$ 135.00	$ 12,015	$ 24,920	$ 254.00	$ 115.00	$ 10,235.00	$ 22,606.00	$ 290.00	$ 160.00	$ 14,240.00	$ 25,810.00
7	Pram ramp	74	$ 2,000.00	$ 900.00	$ 66,600	$ 148,000	$ 2,150.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 88,800.00	$ 159,100.00	$ 1,290.00	$ 990.00	$ 73,260.00	$ 95,460.00
8	crosover concrete	2529	$ 180.00	$ 85.00	$ 214,965	$ 455,220	$ 200.00	$ 95.00	$ 240,255.00	$ 505,800.00	$ 195.00	$ 130.00	$ 328,770.00	$ 493,155.00
9	Conection to stormwater >1m	150	$ 100.00		$ 15,000	$ 15,000	$ 100.00		$ 15,000.00	$ 15,000.00	$ 95.00		$ 14,250.00	$ 14,250.00
10	SEP conversion to double	36	$ 5,000.00		$ 180,000	$ 180,000	$ 7,000.00		$ 252,000.00	$ 252,000.00	$ 1,620.00		$ 58,320.00	$ 58,320.00
11	Deflector Double SEP	36	$ 500.00		$ 18,000	$ 18,000	$ 500.00		$ 18,000.00	$ 18,000.00	$ 690.00		$ 24,840.00	$ 24,840.00
12	Tree Net Pits	214	$ 1,500.00		$ 321,000	$ 321,000	$ 3,500.00		$ 749,000.00	$ 749,000.00	$ 1,298.00		$ 277,772.00	$ 277,772.00
13	Traffic control	287	$ 850.00		$ 243,950	$ 243,950	$ 1,000.00		$ 287,000.00	$ 287,000.00	$ 640.00		$ 183,680.00	$ 183,680.00
			Total	$ 1,578.00	$ 1,747,262	$ 2,813,075	Total		$ 2,385,322.00	$ 3,695,476	Total		$ 1,932,782.00	$ 2,894,126

Project - Pacific Ave

No	Type of work	Assumption	Nova Prep & Lay	Nova Lay only	Nova Cost (Lay only)	Nova Cost (Prep & Lay)	Parisi Paving Prep & Lay	Parisi Paving Lay only	Parisi Paving Cost (Lay only)	Parisi Paving Cost (Prep & Lay)	Remo Prep & Lay	Remo Lay only	Remo Cost (Lay only)	Remo Cost (Prep & Lay)
1	Machine laid kerb	5694	$ 173.90	$ 60.55	$ 344,772	$ 990,187	$ 190.00	$ 117.96	$ 671,664.24	$ 1,081,860.00	$ 179.00	$ 81.90	$ 466,338.60	$ 1,019,226
2	Hand Laid Kerb (approximately	295	$ 184.40	$ 88.75	$ 26,181	$ 54,398	$ 190.00	$ 122.96	$ 36,273.20	$ 56,050.00	$ 178.00	$ 81.90	$ 24,160.50	$ 52,510
3	Invert	2078	$ 161.70	$ 86.20	$ 179,124	$ 336,013	$ 223.50	$ 151.46	$ 314,733.88	$ 464,433.00	$ 209.00	$ 118.00	$ 245,204.00	$ 434,302
4	Concrete plinth	0	$ 144.90	$ 73.90	$ -	$ -	$ 209.50	$ 137.46	$ -	$ -	$ 169.00	$ 70.00	$ -	$ -
5	Spoon Drain - 600mm	0	$ 178.70	$ 124.60	$ -	$ -	$ 237.50	$ 165.46	$ -	$ -	$ 192.00	$ 89.00	$ -	$ -
6	Spoon Darin - 900mm	89	$ 200.85	$ 134.45	$ 11,966	$ 17,876	$ 247.50	$ 175.46	$ 15,615.94	$ 22,027.50	$ 229.00	$ 122.00	$ 10,858.00	$ 20,381
7	Pram ramp	74	$ 1,400.00	$ 1,081.85	$ 80,057	$ 103,600	$ 1,997.50	$ 1,925.46	$ 142,484.04	$ 147,815.00	$ 1,757.00	$ 1,130.00	$ 83,620.00	$ 130,018
8	crosover concrete	2529	$ 118.35	$ 93.15	$ 235,576	$ 299,307	$ 185.00	$ 112.96	$ 285,675.84	$ 467,865.00	$ 187.00	$ 101.00	$ 255,429.00	$ 472,923
9	Conection to stormwater >1m	150	$ 48.00		$ 7,200	$ 7,200	$ 45.00		$ 6,750.00	$ 6,750.00	$ 68.60		$ 10,290.00	$ 10,290
10	SEP conversion to double	36	$ 4,300.00		$ 154,800	$ 154,800	$ 6,049.00		$ 217,764.00	$ 217,764.00	$ 7,106.00		$ 255,816.00	$ 255,816
11	Deflector Double SEP	36	$ 453.55		$ 16,328	$ 16,328	$ 1,200.00		$ 43,200.00	$ 43,200.00	$ 2,036.00		$ 73,296.00	$ 73,296
12	Tree Net Pits	214	$ 1,190.00		$ 254,660	$ 254,660	$ 2,000.00		$ 428,000.00	$ 428,000.00	$ 2,500.00		$ 535,000.00	$ 535,000
13	Traffic control	287	$ 800.00		$ 229,600	$ 229,600	$ 990.00		$ 284,130.00	$ 284,130.00	$ 1,385.00		$ 397,495.00	$ 397,495
			Total		$ 1,540,264	$ 2,483,968	Total		$ 2,446,291.14	$ 3,219,895	Total		$ 2,357,507.10	$ 3,401,257

Project - Pacific Ave

No	Type of work	Assumption	Trueline Kerbing Prep & Lay	Trueline Kerbing Lay only	Trueline Kerbing Cost (Lay only)	Trueline Kerbing Cost (Prep & Lay)
1	Machine laid kerb	5694	$ 235.00	$ 62.00	$ 353,028.00	$ 1,338,090.00
2	Hand Laid Kerb (approximately	295	$ 255.00	$ 97.00	$ 28,615.00	$ 75,225.00
3	Invert	2078	$ 280.00	$ 103.00	$ 214,034.00	$ 581,840.00
4	Concrete plinth	0	$ 212.00	$ 75.00	$ -	$ -
5	Spoon Drain - 600mm	0	$ 285.00	$ 98.00	$ -	$ -
6	Spoon Darin - 900mm	89	$ 315.00	$ 128.00	$ 11,392.00	$ 28,035.00
7	Pram ramp	74	$ 2,000.00	$ 1,050.00	$ 77,700.00	$ 148,000.00
8	crosover concrete	2529	$ 167.00	$ 92.00	$ 232,668.00	$ 422,343.00
9	Conection to stormwater >1m	150	$ 103.00		$ 15,450.00	$ 15,450.00
10	SEP conversion to double	36	$ 5,000.00		$ 180,000.00	$ 180,000.00
11	Deflector Double SEP	36	$ 1,165.00		$ 41,940.00	$ 41,940.00
12	Tree Net Pits	214	$ 1,470.00		$ 314,580.00	$ 314,580.00
13	Traffic control	287	$ 1,150.00		$ 330,050.00	$ 330,050.00
			Total		$ 1,799,457.00	$ 3,475,553