Confidential Item

For Council meeting to be held on

Tuesday 18 July 2017 at 7.30 pm

Refer Item 11.3

Footpath Paving Works Tender

CONFIDENTIAL

Date of assessment 23/06/2017

Name of Assessors: Sylvia Soon, Willie Wong, Andrian Wiguna

The Tender Selection System is a weighted point score system which allows both price and non-price attributes to be taken into account in the selection of the preferred tender.

1. During the Tender evaluation process, each submission is evaluated on the criteria nominated in the Tender. Point scores are allocated in the range (to 5 on the following basis:

Points	Description
5	Excellent
4	Very Good
3	Good or better than average
2	Acceptable
1	Marginally adequate; or success likely but not assured
0	will fail to satisfy required standards

2. After the allocation of point scores to criteria, they are multiplied by the relevant nominated weights and summed to determine an overall score.
3. For the assessment of price, the following point score formula is used:
P = 2.5 + 5 ($M - $T) / $M where: ($T = tender price) ($M = mean price)

	Procurement Selection Criteria				Procurement Selection Criteria			
	Relevant Experience of Contractor (ie previous work of this type etc)				Track Record of Contractor (General reputation for work competence, capacity etc)			
Criteria Weighting (%)	10				10			
	Point Score	Comments	Weighting	Weighted Score	Point Score	Comments	Weighting	Weighted Score
Contractor								
Boral Hollostone Masonry	3	Never had any experience however other Councils use them	10	30	3	all based on reference check	10	30
Nova Group Services	4	Council current contractor for over 10 yrs	10	40	3		10	30
TFS Civil Pty Ltd	3	Never had any experience however other Councils use them	10	30	3		10	30
			10	0			10	0
			10	0			10	0
			10	0			10	0
			10	0			10	0

	Procurement Selection Criteria				Procurement Selection Criteria			
	Technical Skills (People, systems, specific abilities etc)				Methodology (how the project is to be tackled, scope of work etc)			
Criteria Weighting (%)	15				15			
	Point Score	Comments	Weighting	Weighted Score	Point Score	Comments	Weighting	Weighted Score
Contractor								
Boral Hollostone Masonry	3	Never had any experience however other Councils use them	15	45	3	Never had any experience however other Councils use them	15	45
Nova Group Services	3	Council current contractor for over 10 yrs	15	45	3.5	Council current contractor for over 10 yrs and generally have no issues	15	52.5
TFS Civil Pty Ltd	2.5	Never had any experience however other Councils use them	15	37.5	3	Never had any experience however other Councils use them	15	45
0			15	0			15	0
0			15	0			15	0
0			15	0			15	0

	Procurement Selection Criteria				Procurement Selection Criteria			
	Management (organisation, acceptable insurances, economic stability, quality system, WHS system etc)				Time Performance (as proposed for project - likelihood of meeting it)			
Criteria Weighting (%)	15				15			
	Point Score	Comments	Weighting	Weighted Score	Point Score	Comments	Weighting	Weighted Score
Contractor								
Boral Hollostone Masonry	4	establlished company that specialising in producing and laying bricks for over 10 years	15	60	3	Never had any experience however other Councils use them	15	45
Nova Group Services	3.5	establlished company that specialising in laying bricks for over 10 years	15	52.5	3.5	Council current contractor for over 10 yrs and generally have no issues	15	52.5
TFS Civil Pty Ltd	3	establlished company that specialising in laying bricks for over 10 years	15	45	3	Never had any experience however other Councils use them	15	45
0			15	0			15	0
0			15	0			15	0
0			15	0			15	0

	Procurement Selection Criteria				
	Price				
Criteria Weighting (%)	20				
	Price	Comments	Point Score	Weighting	Weighted Score
Contractor					
Boral Hollostone Masonry	$ 427,127.00		-3.97274	20	-79.5
Nova Group Services	$ 245,913.94		0.89469	20	17.9
TFS Civil Pty Ltd	$ 630,000.00		-9.42195	20	-188.4
0	$0		0	20	0.0
0	$0		0	20	0.0
0	$0		0	20	0.0
	$0		0	20	0.0

	Total	Comments
Criteria Weighting (%)	100	
	Highest Score is Best	
Contractor		
Boral Hollostone Masonry	175.55	
Nova Group Services	290.39	
TFS Civil Pty Ltd	44.06	
0	0.00	
0	0.00	
0	0.00	
0		

			Boral Hollostone Masonry	Nova Group Services	TFS Civil
Item	**Description**	**Unit**	**$ Rate(ex GST)**	**$ Rate(ex GST)**	**$ Rate(ex GST)**
1	Lay Paving	m^2	$58.94	$32.63	$92.85
2	Paving(Lift & Re-Lay)	m^2	$46.97	$39.94	$54.28
3	Paving Renewal(Remove existing and lay new pavers)	m^2	$46.97	$32.63	$70.71
4	Pram Ramps	Each	$1,271.75	$887.72	$1,200.00
5	Stormwater Pipes	Each	$99.09	$34.45	$55.00
6	IP Surrounds	Each	$48.03	$45.00	$155.00
NOTE – All works and prices to include removal of the existing item including disposal, excavation, saw cutting of concrete or bitumen, base course construction and the install of pavers (supplied by others) / pram ramps, tactiles and any reinstatement/backfill required.					

Table 1: Unit rate received from each tenderer

			Boral Hollostone Masonry	Nova Group Services	TFS Civil
Item	**Description**	**Unit**	**$ Rate(ex GST)**	**$ Rate(ex GST)**	**$ Rate(ex GST)**
1	Lay Paving	m^2	$353,640.00	$195,780.00	$557,100.00
2	Paving(Lift & Re-Lay)	m^2	$0	$0	$0
3	Paving Renewal(Remove existing and lay new pavers)	m^2	$0	$0	$0
4	Pram Ramps	Each	$66,131.00	$46,161.44	$62,400.00
5	Stormwater Pipes	Each	$4,954.50	$1,722.50	$2,750.00
6	IP Surrounds	Each	$2,401.50	$2,250.00	$7,750.00
Total Estimated Price			$427,127.00	$245,913.94	$630,000.00

Table 2: Assumptions made for 6000m^2 of footpath installation, 52 pram ramps, 50 IP adjustments and 50 stormwater pipes replacement