



Confidential Item

For Council meeting to be held on

Tuesday 18 March 2025 at 7:00 pm

Refer Item 11.9

Confidential Item

11.9 Tender Report – Footpath Works 2024/2025

Contract and Fleet Coordinator, Andrew King & General Manager Infrastructure,
Planning & Sustainability Services, Andrian Wiguna's Report

Purpose of Report

To advise Council of the outcome of a Tender Evaluation for the Footpath Paving Works for 2024/2025.

Strategic Plan Link

Focus Area 3.1.2 Embrace proactive and innovative maintenance for all assets

Previous Council/Committee Resolution

Nil

Background

Tenders were called for the provision of Footpath Paving Works within Campbelltown City Council. Multiple options were requested:

- Supply Pavers
- Supply and Lay Pavers
- Lay Pavers.

The contract term is for the 2024/2025, 2025/2026, 2026/2027 Financial Years, ending 30 June 2027 and subject to satisfactory performance and any other conditions which may prevail at the time, Council may consider one (1) optional right of renewal for two (2) years to be exercised at Council's absolute discretion.

Tender submissions were downloaded on 3 December 2024 in the presence of Council's Manager Finance, Senior Accountant and Administration Officer Finance.

Discussion

Two organisations submitted a Tender for this project:

- Best Bricks & Pavers
- Nova Group Services.

The tenders were assessed by a Tender Evaluation Panel with respect to their reliability, business capability, quality of service, environment management system, work health and safety systems, any previous works undertaken by the companies and the tendered rates. Both tenders met the specifications that Council required through the tender documentation. Attached separately is the tender evaluation report for Members' information.

The assessment panel believe that both tenderers could deliver the project based on the following criteria:

- Proven experience on similar projects
- Past project capacity including their track record
- Understanding of the project
- Experienced Staff
- High regard to WHS
- Understanding of the project
- Well experienced Staff
- Project Management Skills
- Competitive rates.

The two tenderers have been undertaking these services (supply and/or lay) for Council and other various metropolitan Councils for a number of years.

Council has worked with both tenderers in the past. Nova Group Service (a local business in Newton) has been Council's long-standing contractor for constructing footpaths and Best Brick has been the paving supplier for Council. Both companies have proven to be very flexible in meeting the needs and the requirements of the project.

The unit rate cost comparison is shown in Table 1 below:

Unit Rates	Nova Group Services	Best Brick & Pavers
Supply and Lay (\$/m2)	\$99.80	\$86.98
Lay only (\$/m2)	\$67.50	\$62.71
Supply Pavers only (\$/m2)	\$32.85	\$25.84
Other Associated Costs	Nova Group Services	Best Brick & Pavers
Haunching	\$15.00	\$14.24
Pram Ramp	\$1,300.00	\$1,456.04
Stormwater IP	\$42.00	\$204.18
IP Surround	\$55.00	\$74.25
Traffic Management	\$833.00	\$1,088.87

Table 1: Cost comparison

As per the Table 1 above, when comparing the tendered price submission, Best Brick & Pavers price is more competitive compared to Nova Group for Supply and Lay options, however Best Brick & Pavers is very competitive for Supply Pavers only while Nova Group is more competitive for lay only. Please note, Best Brick & Pavers is also a paving manufacturing company and Nova Group Services is a civil contractor specialising in delivering civil works, including footpath construction. Best Brick & Pavers, as a paver manufacturer, has supplied pavers to the Council for several years without any issue

Therefore, Staff are more confident in Best Brick & Pavers supplying the pavers, with Nova Group Services undertaking the laying. This is consistent with the current practice which has served Council well for many years.

Consequently, based on the information provided, Staff recommend that the Council split the contracts, awarding Nova Group Services the 'Lay Only' contract and Best Brick & Pavers the 'Supply Pavers Only' contract.

The total estimated cost for the 2024/2025 footpath program is approximately \$384,104 for 'Footpath Laying Only' and \$114,536 for 'Supply Pavers Only', resulting in a combined total cost of \$498,640. This can be funded within the budget adopted for 2024/2025.

Social Implications

There are no social implications in relation to this report.

Environmental Implications

Where practical, Staff will use permeable pavers. Furthermore, Best Bricks & Pavers has expanded their commitment to using recycled material in all of their traditional paver lines

Asset Management Implications

Any assets installed or upgraded will be depreciated and maintained accordingly.

Governance / Risk Management

Management of tenders in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy is good governance and best practice to minimise reputational risk.

Through this arrangement, the preferred contractors will have a combined value of less than \$1 million per year, however with the term of the contract being the remainder of 2024/2025, plus the 2025/2026, 2026/2027 Financial Years, ending 30 June 2027 (plus a two additional year extension at Council's discretion), it is recommended that Council endorse the engagement of the preferred contractors, as the combined expenditure is beyond the Chief Executive Officer's financial delegation.

Community Engagement

There are no Community engagement implications in relation to this report.

Regional Implications

There are no regional implications in relation to this report.

Economic Development Implications

The engagement of two family owned South Australian business (one based in Newton) will help the South Australian economy.

Financial Implications

The costs to supply and deliver the project are by unit rates. The total cost based on 2024/2025 footpath program for Footpath Laying only is approximately \$384,104 and to supply pavers is \$114,536 with total cost of \$498,640.

Council's future footpath budget will be set, based on the final listings endorsed by Council utilising the tendered rates.

Recommendation

That Council authorise Staff to engage Best Bricks & Pavers for the supply of pavers and Nova Group for the actual laying of pavers and associated works at their quoted unit rates for Council's Footpath program for the 2024/2025, 2025/2026, 2026/2027 Financial Years, with an optional right of renewal for an additional two (2) years, to be exercised at Council's absolute discretion.



CAMPBELLTOWN CITY COUNCIL

Tender Evaluation Report

Footpath Paving Works 2024

Cost centre Various

Date: 6/3/25

Prepared by: Andrew King

1. Background

The Campbelltown City Council invited tenders from companies for the provision of footpath paving works comprising of the construction of footpath paving, the supply of concrete pavers, the construction of concrete pram ramps and associated civil works accommodating the requirements of Council's Capital Works Program.

2. Contract Term

The contract term is for the 24/25, 25/26, 26/27 Financial Years, ending 30/6/27. Subject to satisfactory performance and any other conditions which may prevail at the time the Council may consider one (1) optional rights of renewal of two (2) years to be exercised at Council's absolute discretion.

3. Procurement Process

3.1. Open Tender Process

The Tender was released on the SA Tenders & Contract website.
(www.tenders.sa.gov.au).

Tenders Opened: 12/11/24

Tenders Closed: 3/12/24 - 2:00pm

3.2. Document Issued

The document issued is the standard CCC RFT package, (ECM 6876731)

3.3. Tender Enquiries

No tender enquiries were received during the procurement process.

3.4. Tender Briefing & Site Visit

No tender briefing or site visits were conducted.

4. Receipt of Tender & Evaluation

4.1. Receipt of Tenders

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

- Best Bricks & Pavers
- Nova Group Services

No late tenders were received.

Tenders were opened shortly after the Closing Time by three Council staff that signed and documented the receipt of each tender. (ECM 6884733)

4.2. Evaluation Panel

The evaluation Panel consisted of:

- Ernie Icolaro
- Andrian Wiguna
- Wade Della Torre
- Derek Lawson - Risk Management - Management(WHS System & Insurances only)
- Lisa Gergos - Manager Finance (or nominee) - Management (Financial & Economic Stability only)

Each Member of the Evaluation Panel completed the Tender Declaration Form and declared “No Conflict of Interest” and agreed to keep confidential the contents of each tender. (ECM 6893684)

4.3. Evaluation Criteria

The evaluation criteria are as follow:

#	Assessment Criteria	Weighting
1	Relevant Experience (Previous work of this type etc.)	10.00%
2	Track Record (General reputation for work competence, capacity etc.)	10.00%
3	Technical Skills (People, systems, specific abilities etc.)	12.50%
4	Methodology (The project process, scope of work, value add, Assumptions / Exclusions etc.)	12.50%
5	Management (Organisation, Environmental, Quality System)	5.00%
6	Time Performance (Meeting timeframes)	5.00%
7	Management (Insurances & WHS System)	7.50%
8	Management (Financial & Economic Stability)	7.50%
9	Local (Products, Goods/Works/Services & Contractors)	10.00%
10	Price	20.00%
	TOTAL	100.00%

4.4. Evaluation Selection

The evaluation was individually carried out by each evaluation panel member and then averaged out on (18/12/24) and the full evaluation matrix is in (ECM 6893688).

The summary of the evaluation is below:

Contractor	Price	Total Score	Rank
		100.0%	
Best Bricks & Pavers	\$515,734	334.02	2
Nova Group Services Pty Ltd	\$527,274	338.48	1

The summary of cost estimation is provided in the appendix.

4.5. Reference Checks

No reference check were undertaken as Council has used these contractors before and were satisfied with their performance.

5. Discussion

The 2 submissions for the Tender were detailed and it was a competitive process and both contractors have a good:

- Understanding of the project
- Well experienced staff
- Quality systems in place
- Project Management Skills
- Competitive rates
- Relevant experience

The two tenderers have been undertaking these services (supply and lay) for various metropolitan Councils for a number of years. Council has worked with both of tenderers in the past. Nova Group Service has been Council long standing contractor for laying paved footpaths and Best Brick has been the paving supplier for Council. They have both proven to be very flexible in meeting the needs and the requirements of the project.

6. Financial Implication

The unit rate cost comparison is shown in Table 1 below:

Unit Rates	Nova Group Services	Best Brick & Pavers	Differences
Supply and Lay (\$/m2)	\$99.80	\$ 86.98	\$ 12.82
Lay only (\$/m2)	\$ 67.50	\$ 62.71	\$ 4.79
Supply Pavers only (\$/m2)	\$ 32.85	\$ 25.84	\$ 7.01
Other Associated Cost	Nova Group Services	Best Brick & Pavers	Differences
Haunching	\$ 15.00	\$ 14.24	\$ 0.76
Pram Ramp	\$ 1,300.00	\$ 1,456.04	\$ 156.04
Stormwater IP	\$ 42.00	\$ 204.18	\$ 162.18
IP Surround	\$ 55.00	\$ 74.25	\$ 19.25
Traffic Management	\$ 833.00	\$ 1,088.87	\$ 255.87

Table 1: Cost comparison

As per the Table 1 above, when comparing the tendered price submission, Nova Group Services price is not more competitive compared to Best Brick & Paver for Supply and Lay and Lay only options, and, Best Brick & Pavers is very competitive for Supply Pavers Only. Please note, Best Brick & Pavers is a paving manufacturing company.

Therefore, based on the cost comparison above, staff believe the most efficient option for the Council is to split the contracts, awarding Nova Group Services the Lay Only contract and Best Brick & Pavers the Supply Pavers Only contract. This is because Best Brick & Pavers is a paver manufacturing company, while Nova Group Services is a civil contractor that specialises in delivering civil works, including footpath laying construction.

The total cost based on the 2024/2025 footpath program is approximately \$384,104 for Footpath Laying Only and \$114,536 for Supply Pavers Only, with a combined total cost of \$498,640

The costs to supply and deliver the project are by unit rates and currently there are adequate funds in the budget for 2025/2026.

7. Terms of Payment

The contractor has requested payment of contract sum as highlighted below.

Option 3 (Schedule of Rates)

- ☒ Where the Contract is a Schedule of Rates the Contractor may at monthly intervals (or as otherwise specified in this agreement) submit a written claim for the works completed / service delivered.

8. Financial Sustainability

The Finance department tender evaluation is part for the final combined assessment.

It is noted the preferred contractors provided either insufficient financial statements or were deemed of "Poor Finance Stability", however due to the nature of the services provided (whereby services are paid for once completed) the assessment panel believes the risk is low for Council if the company becomes insolvent, the service could be easily replaced.

9. Recommendation

That Best Bricks & Pavers be engaged for the supply of pavers only and Nova Group for the actual laying of pavers and associated works at their quote unit rates.

The costs to supply and deliver the project are by unit rates. The total cost based on 2024/2025 footpath program for Footpath Laying only is approximately \$384,104 and to supply pavers is \$114,536 with total cost of \$498,640.

Although through this arrangement, the preferred contractor will have a combined value of less than \$1m per year, however along with the term of the contract being for the 2024/2025, 2025/2026, 2026/2027 Financial Years, (plus a two additional year extension at Council's discretion), it is recommended that Council endorse the engagement of the preferred contractor.

10. Approval

Endorsed by:

Signed: _____ Date: _____

General Manager Infrastructure, Planning and Sustainability Services Andrian Wiguna

Endorsed by:

Signed: _____ Date: _____

Chief Executive Officer

Appendix 1: Cost Comparison

Pricing schedule comparison (Rubble Basecourse & Bedding Sand)											
Works to be Undertaken	Schedule	Item	Tendered Rates		Volumes	Supply & Lay		Lay Only		Supply Only	
			Nova	Best		Nova	Best	Nova	Best	Nova	Best
Supply, Prep & Lay (\$/m2)	Schedule 1	Item 1	\$99.80	\$86.98	2955	\$442,363.50	\$385,538.85				
Prep & Lay Only (\$/m2)	Schedule 2	Item 1	\$67.50	\$62.71				\$299,193.75	\$277,962.08		
Pavers Only - Type 1 (\$/m2)	Pavers Schedule	Item 1	\$32.85	\$25.84						\$145,607.63	\$114,535.80
Haunching	Schedule 1	Item 7	\$15.00	\$14.24	0	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00		
Pram Ramp	Schedule 1	Item 4	\$1,300.00	\$1,456.04	27	\$35,100.00	\$39,313.08	\$35,100.00	\$39,313.08		
Stormwater IP	Schedule 1	Item 5	\$42.00	\$204.18	170	\$7,140.00	\$34,710.60	\$7,140.00	\$34,710.60		
IP Surround	Schedule 1	Item 6	\$55.00	\$74.25		\$9,350.00	\$12,622.50	\$9,350.00	\$12,622.50		
Traffic Management	Schedule 1	Item 8	\$833.00	\$1,088.87	40	\$33,320.00	\$43,554.80	\$33,320.00	\$43,554.80		
						\$527,273.50	\$515,739.83	\$384,103.75	\$408,163.06	\$145,607.63	\$114,535.80